Factors Involved in Assessing Capacity of Creative Tourism: Case Study - Tabriz City in Iran

Fereshteh Doosti*, Mohammad Hassan Zaal and Mehdi Ramezanzadeh Lasbuie
Department of Tourism Management, University of Mazandaran, Iran

Abstract
As commonly understood, the importance of creativity in tourism studies and market can be conceived in relation to art crafts and creative products over the years, shifting to a wide range of tourism-based activities. It is believed that these activities can be considered as general forces for tourism development, as a result there is a dramatic growth in the popularity of creative tourism. Nowadays, tourists have a noticeable tendency to refrain from repeated activities in order to profit from new feelings and experiences. Creative tourism activities have provided an opportunity for tourists to learn more about local skills, expertise, traditions and unique qualities of the places they are visiting. In this research, the capacity of creative tourism in Tabriz city in Iran has been studied. Variables related to creativity including creative class, creative economy, creative experience, creative city, and creative tourism has been gathered from various researches. And, a questionnaire has been arranged and distributed among 60 tourism experts in this city. Then, the hidden factors in the development of creative tourism have been identified using factor analysis. Finally, eight factors, out of 29 variables, such as “physical capital and visual assets”, “personality upgrading”, “passive rules and scientific genius”, “informative environment”, “excellent coexistence”, “an introduction of new ideas”, “risk takers”, and “leisure time” have been extracted from the experts’ perspectives of this city. By investing in cultural affairs and the enrichment of urban space and the quality of educational affairs, this city has made impressive strides towards attracting creative classes and developing creative tourism in order to become a creative city.

Keywords: Capacity assessment; Creativity; Creative city; Creative tourism

Introduction
An important consideration is that major changes have been manifested in tourists’ desire, their willingness to gain valuable experiences, having deep understanding of places, and spending more time on enjoying the places. This means that various tourists have sought out experiences in which they are able to meet their intangible urges through participation. Tourism destination need to expand its resources for successful presence in the tourism market and to cope with the challenge of improving tourism marketing strategies. Hence, the creative tourism approach have regarded as a solution to tourists and tourism destination. Creative tourism has known as an escape route from the re-production of cultural assets of tourism destination contributing the preserve of original cultures and intangible heritage such as music, dance, customs and traditions and handicrafts [1].

The standardization of cultural tourism as well as a change in tourists’ motivations has led to the development of a new form of tourism in all over the world. Indeed, creative tourism has considered as a form that avoids the reproduction of cultural assets and enhances the intangible cultural resources of a destination into more participative experiences. If the country uses and fosters this effective form of tourism, it will face a severe economic crisis [2].

Creative tourism has considered as a new generation of tourism. One participant has voiced the idea that the first generation is “beach tourism,” in which people come to a place for relaxation and leisure; the second refers to “cultural tourism,” oriented toward museums and cultural tours. “Creative Tourism” involves more interaction in which a visitor has an educational, emotional, social, and participative interaction with the place, its living culture, and the people who live there. They feel like a citizen. The third generation requires that managers develop and recognize the creativity within their city as a resource, and provide new opportunities to increase tourists’ interests [3]. The growth of creative tourism is the result of an expansion or reaction to cultural tourism in which creative consumers, in comparison to traditional cultural tourists, seek more interactive experiences in order to develop their own personality and create identity [4,5]. Richards and Wilson [6] have argued that creative tourism is definitely more potential than traditional cultural tourism because creativity is simply more value-added and pave the way for innovating new products quickly. As a result, creative resources are more sustainable and more dynamic than tangible cultural products.

Although cultural tourism was considered as an answer to the ever-rising tourism demand in the past [7], it is not sufficiently attractive, responsive, and durable in the present time. Jelinčić and Žuvela [8] have believed that cultural tourism has become an active mass tourism. According to Richards [9] at the Santa Fe Creative Tourism Conference, visiting churches, museums or art galleries with hundreds of people who are dramatically increasing is an undesirable but inevitable experience [10]. Recent research has suggested that visitors’ interests have really changed. They have eager to gain authentic experience, to understand places deeply and to spend more time for visiting the space and environment of that city or region [7].

Nowadays, cities are looking for industries that, while boosting the city’s economy, will ensure the comprehensive development of the
According to Chris Smith [15], the former Minister of Culture in UK, creativity is the ability to enable people to think new and create new ideas and new ways to do things. Creativity is also the most important component of the sense of identity of individuals, the local community, the city, or a nation [2]. According to Kunzmann [16], creativity is the ability to develop new projects, processes, and methods. The concept of creativity involves both imaginative and multidimensional thinking, unconventional ideas, and the desire to create new things without fear of taking risk.

Creativity is prevalent and pervasive in all human activities such as furniture we use, a novel we read, films we watch and technologies we enjoy. So, it can be clearly seen that a creative mind bring up these activities [17]. Batey founds that many researchers and psychologists define creativity using terms such as new, original, and useful [18].

Creativity has become more indebted to the use of conventional cognitive processes as a mental phenomenon and creative thinking can be almost achieved by everyone, given the creative approach [19]. Additionally, Ericsson [20] suggests that some exceptional human peculiarities are acquired than hereditary, and even a creative genius cannot easily accomplish a difficult apprenticeship. Creativity is an activity that has been developed throughout human life and a particular environment, family and conditions will surely be needed for the emergence of creative personality. A shift in the opinions pertaining to creativity occurs only in the minds of individuals to the attitudes towards creativity occurs in social fabric has been apparent in some researches. Creativity can be outperform and educate at schools and workshops. And, it seems that certain family environments and circumstances lead to the emergence of creative personalities [21].

The United Nations [13] recognizes the creativity characteristics in different areas as following:

- Artistic creativity involves the imagination and production capacity of the main ideas and new ways of interpreting the world expressed in terms of text, sound and image.
- Scientific creativity involves curiosity and the willingness to experiment and create new relationships in problem solving.
- Economic creativity includes a dynamic process leading innovation in technology, business practices, marketing and gaining competitive advantage in the economy, as well.

All of the characteristics mentioned above are more or less related to technology innovation [13] (Figure 1).

![Figure 1: Creativity in today's economy (UN, 2010).](image-url)
According to Tiemann et al. [22], creativity has been defined variously with little differences which the focal point of many of these definitions refers to novelty or the creation of new things. Novelty is not usually a new brand it refers to creating something that is transformative such as the creation of a railroad network or a personal computer.

Creativity is inherently connected to innovation. O’Sullivan and Dooley [23] argue that creativity requires a level of originality and novelty that is essential for innovation. Although creativity is the quintessential feature of innovation, the alternative use of them makes a mistake. Innovation encourages more processing of exclusion data, while the creative process (idea) provides an opportunity to utilize potential values through development [24]. According to these authors, innovation is the process of making big and small, radical and incremental changes on products, processes and services which has led to the introduction of something new to the organization and adds value to customers and contributes to a set of organizational knowledge.

Some authors explore the importance and relevance of creativity and innovation in the world of cultural or creative industries. Burt [25] claims that the dynamics of creativity and innovation within cultural industries in the value chain are highly elusive. Here, creativity is considered as a process in which iconic and beautiful changes create new ideas or hamper evolution.

Burt [25] reminds that innovation has considered as the implementation of ideas (which may not be creative) and are directed towards users. Therefore, what is basically important in creativity, it is not simply the production of new ideas, but the value generated by these ideas, and this value is apparent in the implementation of ideas through innovation.

Creative City

Bianchini [26] describes five dimensions introducing the city as a complex and multifaceted unit, as follows:

- It is defined by geographical boundaries and consists of certain natural conditions
- It is formed by human interventions in the infrastructure, buildings, streets and public spaces
- The social community consists a group of people with certain social networks and social participations
- It is a system of economic and communications activities
- It is a social and economic place that governed by specific rules and regulations based on the interactions between political actors.

Both Florida [27] and Landry [28] have concluded that creativity requires a certain framework to sprout and as a result to create economic prosperity. Although Landry has commented on creativity as a personal attribute and he has figured out that it is slightly influenced by urban physical spaces, and even the environment can prevent this effect. From Florida’s [27] view environment is the key of economic, social, and time organizer which it can be improve the quality of space. Establishing a creative environment is vital for the city’s economic success [29].

Florida [27] and Landry [28] emphasize the importance of re-evaluating and rethinking about cities, their role and positioning (at the regional, national and global levels). This indicates a special necessity developed within the concept of a creative city; a city needs to be creative in order to underpin other cities by the benefits of economic growth. The growth or attraction and expansion of the creative class can be the key to the survival of such a city [30].

A creative city is a place to ameliorate artistic creativity, scientific and technological innovation. This city is a vibrant city in terms of cultural and intercultural learning in which every citizen has the confidence to use his scientific, technical, artistic and cultural capacities [31]. For example, some of the characteristics of a creative city can be noted in Amsterdam, it characteristics consist of historical background, proper structural design, proper economic profile, public and private transport infrastructure, provision of service needs for consumer and producer, communication with other parts of the world through telecommunication and other communications. On the other hand, this city has profited from capabilities including a good environment which seems to be suitable for economic growth, high social capital in the city, the promotion of poor families’ conditions, international migration that is necessary to keep pace with creativity [30].

Florida [27] states that the creative environment gives its inhabitants the idea of shaping, creating, and building the city however they want. Residents are active participants instead of passive consumers. Creating a creative city requires more infrastructure than available hardware. Creative infrastructure is a combination of hardware and software which entails mental infrastructure. In fact, very few places are comprehensively creative, but every city can be more creative than it is.

With regard to Triple Economic Growth Theory, Florida [14] believes that there are three main indicators for measuring the creativity of different locations, and, therefore; he classifies creativity including talent (it is measured by the percentage of residents who have Bachelor’s degree), tolerance (the percentage of population who was born abroad) and technology (the percentage of employment in high technology industries).

Landry and Hayms [32] introduce indicators in designing creative cities to create a way to evaluate cities using holistic approach. This helps cities to assess their spiritual abilities and it actually is a prerequisite for cities with low economic-cultural power and beginner innovations. This strategic tool creates a framework for appropriate political thoughts. The Creative Cities indicators uses the basic information of each city such as location, geographical condition, political geography conditions, statistics such as urban area, employment level, various industrial sectors, voting patterns and participation rates, social and cultural facilities. The researchers designed and categorized all of these indicators in three dimensions: creativity, flexibility, and creative capacity.

At the beginning of the twenty-first century, especially after the recent economic crisis, the attention of the world community has focused on the weaknesses and limitations of global metropolises, and the growing interest in the concept of creativity in the processes of urban development in the creative age has been brought about the definition of creative cities gradually replaced by definition of World cities [33]. Sasaki has introduced the differences between global cities and creative cities in accordance with Table 1:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Creative city</th>
<th>Global city</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Horizontal network</td>
<td>Global hierarchy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative industry</td>
<td>Financial center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban Sustainability</td>
<td>Bubble economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative environment</td>
<td>Social risk</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: the differences between global cities and creative cities.
Another definition of the creative city by Sasaki [33] has presented with more social considerations and more attention to the role of the city’s main inhabitants: Creative cities have promoted new trends in art and culture and innovative industries have been developed by serious and creative activities of artists, creative innovators and ordinary citizens. And, these cities have rich diverse creative and innovative environments as well as a population capacity to solve social problems such as homeless people. Sasaki requires the following components for the creative city (Table 2).

In the creative industry, the overwhelming business is advocated to a small family-run business; these industries are required to create a horizontal networks in order to survive in the global market that are accompanied by creating a horizontal network of creative cities which may bring up many advantages for the membered cities [33].

Based on Gourchi’s studies on the concepts and characteristics of creative cities, people, economic firms, spaces, link sand Communications, prospect have considered as the main components of creative cities in the subsequent years [30],

- People: In the creative city, those conditions and activities that will bring up the emergence of creative artists in the future, the success of creative work forces in all sectors of the economy, the consumers’ urges to cultural goods and an attractive environment for creative people should be considered. Strong public education and the achievement of cultural activities play a vital role in the formation of creative people and lead to the promotion of social engagement.
- Economic firms: Creativity has often led to the creation of social opportunities and cultural entrepreneurs start creative businesses and grow them. The commercialization of innovative and creative ideas is responsible for entrepreneurship and gaining wealth in creative cities. In creative cities, the abundance of creative talent is the main proponent of the creative industries and the economy of the region.
- Space: There is a strong relationship between space and creativity. Creative people need space for life, work, inspiration and showing their talents. The spaces of a city, both natural and artificial, will spur and express the creativity of their inhabitants.
- Links and Communications: A civil environment that seeks to stimulate and support creativity must also be able to link many of the irrelevant actions. These links are often governed and developed by organizations that their mission and vision are creativity. Supporting these links is also provided by the intermediating organizations that organize separate activities and effectively use existing resources.
- Prospect and Renown: In creative cities, the expression of a robust and innovative prospect will spark the growth of talents and will direct and organize the support of creativity in the city.

### Creative Experience

Based on the findings, few studies have been done on the needs of tourists. Maitland [34] has examined the role of tourists and residents in creative cities, and Maisel [35] has drawn a conclusion that many tourists tend to experience issues that are small, exciting and conducted on a human scale. Andereck et al. [36] have proven that social and environmental activities are the components of the overall framework of experience. Cutler and Carmichael [37] state a sense of place is a combination of the physical and spatial aspects of an environment, the meanings of environment, and expresses the past and future experiences. To understand the relationship between creativity and experience, understanding the need for experience is essential. Based on the works conducted by Berlyne [38] and Maslow [39], creativity stands at a higher level of needs hierarchy. Accordingly, Anderson [40] suggests three requirements for experience: general, social, and intellectual requirements which the last one includes the need for newness, excitement and challenges. This means that experience is a process that tourists can achieve creativity through pursuing this process. Richards [41] believes that even on-stage and seemingly mechanical activities, such as hopping jump, can be regarded as creativity in ways that are experienced and responded to by participants.

The common components of creative tourism are credible partnerships and experiences that allow tourists to develop their potential and creative skills through contact with local people and their specific culture [41], and as a result, it is essentially a learning process [17].

Tan et al. [17] investigate and present a creative experience model (Figure 2) in a study of one hundred and forty one creative businesses in Taiwan. The research, conducted by a consulting agency, issues in the classification of six types of experiences in the creative tourism scope, including: food culture, life education, natural environment, interior decoration, historical arts and crafts. The researchers study the creative tourists’ opinions toward creative locations and illustrate those external interactions and internal reflections producing the creative experience model of tourists. It eventually can be concluded that experience includes consciousness or awareness, need and creativity. Hence, awareness can be accounted as a prerequisite for gaining a creative experience and it can differentiate it from other experiences.

### Participation at Creative Tourism

Another approach in the creative tourism scope is focused on the role of cooperation in creation and participation. Creative tourism offers unique experiences [2]. Brink Horst [42] emphasizes the importance of collaborative process in creating and building unique experience: experiences will be concern and belongs to an individual when they not only play an interactive and participatory role, but also create, design, select and reflect on them. This suggests that the necessity of an environment to provide supply and demand process and to improve the communication between producers and consumers is obvious.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Activities and the number of artists, scientists, engineers and craftsmen</th>
<th>Creative talent</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Factors such as the richness of urban space and amenities, leisure time, cultural affairs and entertainment</td>
<td>Quality of Life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of companies and employment in creative cultural industries such as art crafts and music</td>
<td>Creative industry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number and availability of universities, technical centers, research organizations, theaters and libraries</td>
<td>Infrastructure supporting Creativity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Positive participation of all citizens, policy making and financial independence</td>
<td>Creative government</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The number and conditions of keeping tangible and intangible cultural assets</td>
<td>Assets and Cultural Heritage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The status of nonprofit activities, the participation of women in society</td>
<td>Citizen Activities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: components for the creative city.
Cueto-Pedrotti [43] cites involvement and participation as key factors in creative tourism, arguing that they "are focal point to creative tourism. And, the concepts of collaborating in experiential learning are essential in developing creative tourism". Briggs [7] also considers partnership as a key element in creative tourism.

Richards [41] has identified various types of creative tourism in terms of creativity and the level of participation of tourists. Creativity may be considered as an activity related to the high level of participation, or as a background or a passive form of participation, and thus more closely connected to cultural tourism routes (Figure 3).

Visitors’ participation and engagement may include various degrees; it ranges from participating in a festival to build an object (used as a souvenir). Accordingly, creative tourism is a form of tourism based on experiences that the tourists’ activities than service providers or tourists themselves emphasizes more on their experiences [44-59].

**Definition of Creative Tourism**

The origins of creative tourism appeared in Portugal in the mid-1990s, when the European Commission set up a Eurotext project to help handicrafts producers and to recognize their mass-produced products [10]. Richards [45] then, based on his studies, found that if people is unaware of the process of producing art crafts, they will not purchase them in a high price. Therefore, Art and Industry “Alto Minho” was developed in order to provide visitors with the opportunity not only to be in touch with artists but to be part of the work process of making these handmade goods, so that they would understand their value.

It was the first time that Richards and Raymond [5] have described creative tourism as a type of tourism that provides visitors an opportunity to develop their creative potential through active participation in learning courses and experiences that are characteristics of the destination they are lived there [42]. UNESCO defines creative tourism as a journey into an engaging and credible experience by learning collaboratively in the arts, cultural heritage, or particular personality of a place, and communicating with those who live in this place and the culture of life [3].

In New Zealand, the first effort has been made to develop a creative tourism strategy through the amelioration of New Zealand’s Creative Tourism; this term is defined as a sustainable form of tourism that has a real sense of local culture from informal channels, local educational workshops. Workshops are organized in small groups at home and at the workplace of artists that allow visitors to explore their creativity while getting closer to local people. Many of the well-known definitions of creative tourism are related to cultural tourism. Creative tourism, as an aspect of cultural tourism, is very suitable for todays’ visitors and has led to an increase in demand for opportunities for self-development [2].

Hull and Sassenberg [46] have observed that although cultural tourism is considered as a passive observe of things relating to the past, creative tourism is a transition from the past to the future through the establishment of a link between the locals and the visitors (Table 3).

Gordin and Matetskaya [47] believe that the main difference between cultural and creative tourism lies in the main sources of these tourism and in the motivation of tourists to participate in activities. From Campbell’s view [10], the difference between cultural and creative tourism is that creative tourists participate in a creative activity while visiting a destination, while cultural tourists are consumers of cultural experiences.

According to Binkhorst [42] the definition given by Richards and Raymond [5] “reflects the growing interest among individuals to creatively construct by their own and ‘narrative of the self’” while “creative tourism explicitly presented by tourism destinations provides
opportunities to engage with local culture in order to offer a unique experience. As a result, creative tourism can be an appropriate alternative to those destinations delineating a “copy” of culture reproduction. All point taken into consideration, it is believed that creative tourism provides an opportunity for consumers to be creative, thus avoiding the “McGuggenheimization” phenomenon of cultural experiences and enhancing intangible resources. Consequently, Creative tourism may reduce production costs and increase the destination’s flexibility [2].

Table 3: Cultural and Creative Tourism.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Type of tourism</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Cultural Focus</th>
<th>Consumption</th>
<th>Learning</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cultural tourism</td>
<td>Past and present</td>
<td>High culture, popular culture</td>
<td>Product, Process</td>
<td>Passive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Creative tourism</td>
<td>past, present, future</td>
<td>Creative process</td>
<td>Experience, co-production between tourist and local</td>
<td>interactive, Active skill development</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 3: Modes of Creative Tourism (Richards, 2011).

Table 4: The Variable s of research.
As regards as the creative tourism business itself, Campbell [10] coins that not only this tourism provides visitors with more creative follow-up ideas (including arts, crafts and culinary training workshops), but also it Provides high quality of accommodation and communication with local people at a specific destination.

Jelinčić and Žuvela [8] argue that the definition of creative tourism presented by Richards and Raymond [5] is limited to a particular the tourism’s prospect, and even, if they agree with this definition at a certain level, it may leave the opinions of those who offer the tourism product out of consideration. For this purpose, creative tourism may signify creating completely different and new business models in the production, management, marketing or creative sale. Jelinčić and Žuvela claim that creative tourism should teach tourists valuable experience and transfer unique values through the promotion of local identity, and, in fact, this type of tourism is a new plan of tourism in which natural, cultural and personal resources are not manipulated and theirs value is protected.

From some authors’ points of views, a city environment is also considered as a key factor for creative tourism. Den Dekker and Tabbers [48] have also focused on the environment, arguing that the creative activities of visitors were a functionally inseparable from the development of creative tourism in the past, while tourism posit that the creative environment gains visitors’ creative experience in the present time. Brinkhorst [42] advocates a popular approach to creative activities. In this approach, the network of experience is focused and the tourism experience includes all active actors and their surroundings.

According to Gordin and Matasayka [47], creativity can relate to any area of urban life including social, shopping, service, telecommunications, and so on. Therefore, the concept of creative tourism goes beyond the cultural sphere and cultural industries. This type of tourism entails more economic sectors such as the global definitions of the creative economy [49], the creative city [50], creative class and creative work [14] and creative industries [51]. Finally, the variables studied in this study are as follows (Table 4).

Research Approach

This study has been conducted using practical research approach in terms of its purpose and descriptive-analytic in terms of its nature. This study has been developed through using library and documentary research approach, searching in electronic databases and then fieldwork method including interviews and researcher-made questionnaire have been used in order to gather data and information. The statistical population of this study has been selected among tourism experts in the Cultural Heritage Organization, municipalities and university professors, experts in the Department of Tourism Development, and experts in the Journal of Cultural Tourism which will include the information needed to complete the questionnaires distribution process.

Factor analysis and principal components analysis have been used to process the collected data. These techniques have typically used to analyze groups of correlated variables representing one or more common domains; for example, indicators of socioeconomic status, job satisfaction, health, self-esteem, political attitudes or family values. Principal components analysis has applied to find optimal ways of combining variables into a small number of subsets, while factor analysis may be used to identify the structure underlying such variables and to estimate scores to measure latent factors themselves. The main applications of these techniques can be found in the analysis of multiple indicators, measurement and validation of complex constructs, index and scale construction, and data reduction. These approaches are particularly useful in situations where the dimensionality of data and its structural composition are not well known [52].

In this paper, Sample size used in the factor analysis method is at least 50 cases [53], 60 subjects out of the considered experts have been selected among Tourism Research Department at Municipality and Cultural Heritage and Art University and Tourism Development in Tabriz city on the basis of snowball sampling. The questionnaire has distributed among them. Cronbach’s alpha test has used to measure the reliability level of the collected data. Accordingly, the Cronbach’s alpha coefficient is 0.86 which is at an acceptable level.

Demographic Structure

Tabriz has known as the most densely populated city in East Azerbaijan province. Based on the results of the general census of population and housing in 2011, the population of Tabriz is about 1695094 people, therefore, Tabriz has considered as the fifth populated city in Iran, and the population of the center of this city has estimated to be 1506188 people. Of the 169,594 people, the population of the city of Tabriz has been 17.91 percent in urban areas and 83.8 percent in rural areas. In November 2011, out of 1695094 people in the city of Tabriz, 958097 men and 836997 women were women, resulting in a sex ratio of 103. In other words, there were 103 males per 100 women. This ratio is refers to children less than one year old and 107 for adults (65 years and older). The population of Tabriz city is 20.08% in the age group less than 15 years old, 72.94% in the age group of 15-64 years old and 69.6% in the age group of 65 and more.

Tourism Industry in Tabriz has significantly ascended. In recent years, with the efforts of TABRIZ municipality in the field of tourism to introduce Tabriz, this city selected as the most popular tourist destination of the Islamic world in 2018. As respect as, its ancient history and its rich civilization, its location on the Silk Road (AIPEK Yolo), having the largest roofed bazar in the world, the safest and cleanest city, good weather, historical monuments and abundant tourism and various crafts, Tabriz has benefitted conditions of tourism development.

Data Analysis and Results

The research has conducted on an interview between the experts of the Cultural Heritage and Tourism Organization and the Municipality and the sub-collections titled Research and Development of Tourism Research and the University of Art since these experts are familiar with the basic concepts of tourism, especially creative tourism and the creative city. Among 60 respondents, 59 percent are men and 41 percent are women who their specialty scope includes tourism management, tourism deputy, tourism and media, museum guides, communications experts and architects, experts in the private tourism magazine. Respondents are divided into two categories: public and private, based on their type of job, 56 subjects have governmental jobs, and 4 subjects have private jobs (Table 5):

As shown in Table 6 the factor analysis of 29 creative tourism items has resulted in 8 hidden factors. These creative tourism factors are expressed by physical capital / visual assets, personality upgrading, passive laws and scientific genius, informative environment, excellence co-existence, the introduction of new ideas, risk takers and leisure time which their factor loadings 0.058 to 0.912. Consequently, high factor loadings indicate the greater correlation between the Exclusion factors and each variable. The value of KMO test and Bartlett test which
are equivalent to 0/843 and (\(\chi^2=3512/747\), df=666), respectively, is significant at error level less than 0.05.

The first factor is refers to physical capital and visual assets. This factor consists of six variables: the first five items, based on research written by Landry [50] and Sasaki [33] are the characteristics of the creative city, and the latest item, according to Richards’ research [41] is the main feature of creative tourism which issue from the tourism definition of this word and the partnership between the tourist and the host. According to respondents, the first factor in assessing capacity of creative tourism in Tabriz is the assets and facilities that play an

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Name of the interviewed organization or job</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Women</td>
<td>Men</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Managers and experts of the Organization of Heritage, Tourism and Handicrafts of East Azerbaijan province</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty of Art University of Tabriz</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Deputy of Tabriz Municipality</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Museum guides</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism Research and Development Unit</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Media Tourism Unit and Communications Experts based in the Heritage Organization</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experts of the Private Tourism Magazine (Cooperation with the Research and Development Unit)</td>
<td>:</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5: Respondents profile.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The factors and Variable s of creative tourism</th>
<th>Factor load</th>
<th>Initial Eigenvalues Total</th>
<th>Initial Eigenvalues % of variance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>First factor: physical capital/visual assets</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 12: The richness of urban space and amenities</td>
<td>0/891</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 13: The richness of cultural affairs and entertainment</td>
<td>0/848</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 14: World reputation</td>
<td>0/826</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 16: The quality of educational affairs</td>
<td>0/532</td>
<td>7/425</td>
<td>25/603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 15: Quality of life level</td>
<td>0/531</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 3: The sense of co-operation and cooperation in the family</td>
<td>0/531</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Second factor: personality upgrade</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 20: Individual creativity</td>
<td>0/789</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 21: The amount of sense of competition among individuals</td>
<td>0/771</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 17: Need/Motivation</td>
<td>0/748</td>
<td>4/370</td>
<td>15/170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 18: Creative Experience</td>
<td>0/739</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 19: Individual awareness level</td>
<td>0/647</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Third factor: passive rules and scientific genius</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 26: Suitable policy and financial independence</td>
<td>0/841</td>
<td>3/464</td>
<td>11/945</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 25: Creative state</td>
<td>0/773</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 27: Creativity Support Infrastructure</td>
<td>0/698</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 28: Advanced technology and technology</td>
<td>0/641</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 29: Assets and Cultural Heritage</td>
<td>0/617</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fourth factor: Informative environment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 6: Learning and engagement in services</td>
<td>0/911</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 4: Learning and interaction in the environment</td>
<td>0/874</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 10: Social Responsibility</td>
<td>0/616</td>
<td>2/429</td>
<td>8/378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 7: Ideological and ideological tendencies</td>
<td>0/617</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fifth factor: excellence co-existence</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 9: Integration of Cultures</td>
<td>0/792</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 2: Advisory participation</td>
<td>0/711</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 3: Sense of cooperation and cooperation</td>
<td>0/561</td>
<td>1/967</td>
<td>6/783</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 5: Learning and engagement among individuals</td>
<td>0/518</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sixth factor: the introduction of new ideas</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 1: Cultural Interaction</td>
<td>0/862</td>
<td>1/732</td>
<td>5/972</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 8: Structure and Innovators</td>
<td>0/861</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Seventh factor: risk takers</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 22: Creative class</td>
<td>0/912</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 23: Human Capital</td>
<td>0/533</td>
<td>1/278</td>
<td>4/439</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Variable 17: Need/Motivation</td>
<td>0/514</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Eighth factor: leisure time Variable 11: Free time</td>
<td>0/856</td>
<td>1/193</td>
<td>3/768</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total variance explained</td>
<td>81/956</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6: The factors of creative tourism.
effective role in attracting tourists to this city and in improving the mental, physical, cultural and social development of the region. Experts believe that ameliorating the quality of educational and cultural affairs has played a significant role in educating creative and elite persons, and this was a reason for Castro [2] and Tan et al. [17] research since they have considered the creativity is acquired than hereditary.

The second factor is personality upgrading. This factor is composed of five variables. The respondents have believed that the sense of need for personal development both physically and mentally and creativity is one of the most important factors. Tan et al. [17] have emphasized on the creative experience, consisting three main elements of learning, awareness, and necessity. An important consideration is a variable about the rate competitiveness that has been included by the researcher himself in this study, hence; the variable indicates how the city is successful to encourage people to compete with each other to reach personal progress. This factor describes that creativity can effectively contribute to competition and include the achievement of personality perfection among individuals. Therefore, the second factor is important for respondents, as well [51-59].

The third factor is the passive rules and scientific genius pertaining to two variables. The first category is the variables involved in policy making and the framework of legal freedoms, especially in business that allows people to be creative in their work. These variables are of great importance in the Landry and Hyams [32] research. However, the other categories of factors are related to the elites and thinkers living in the region as well as the kind of infrastructures can be effective in the progress of these individuals, followed by the amelioration of the modern market of technologies. Experts have convinced that although Tabriz has chosen as the capital of Islamic tourism in 2018, officials have not unveiled this city at foreign social networks in the world, and probably the reason is the weakness of the IT and communications sectors in all responsible organizations including the Cultural Heritage and Tourism Organization.

The fourth factor was the informative environment, consisting of four variables. The two main variables are the most influential factors in learning. In contrast to Richards [4] and Tan et al. [17] who have consider learning as the main characteristics of creative experience in tourists, the experts interviewed believe that learning and interactions that take place while shopping a product or service in the environment will have a significant impact on the creativity of the tourist and will contribute to the development of creative tourism. The modern generation has been transmitted, succeeded and made it possible to know more about the tangible assets of this city. Responsibility among people in society also makes them play a significant role in learning and making their engagement.

The fifth factor refers to excellent coexistence, consisting four variables related to social capital. According to Richards and Wilson [6], the issue of collaboration and participation is one of the main factors behind the creative tourism. And, according to Florida [14], factors such as tolerance and acceptance of different cultures and lack of self-esteem lead to the attraction of creative class to use their full potential, both in terms of gaining capitals and socially to promote that city. The partnership of creative class with local people will improve the development of any type of tourism.

The sixth factor is the introduction of new ideas and consists of two variables that are very influential in shaping the creative city, according to Florida [14] and Landry [28] and Sasaki [33] research. Their study relates to revolutionaries and innovators in the host community. Many experts believe that the current society of Tabriz has a traditional thinking and does not allow individuals to eliminate the much closed borders of their culture and society.

The seventh factor is shown as risk takers who are mainly attributed to the variable of the creative class. The same topic is mentioned in Florida research [14], which was credited in the creative city, creative partnership, creative experience, and creative tourism. Florida [14] states that the presence of a highly social-economically group of people in the community leading them to play a decisive role in working procedures. Setting up Productive companies may establish dynamic industries as well as dynamic economy of this region. And, ultimately the flourished economy that relies on its creative drivers leads to progress in all aspects of life in that region.

The last factor in the field of creative tourism is leisure time. This factor is composed of a free time variable. The findings show that due to the mental problems of people in the community, meeting basic needs such as food and clothing, the needs such as self-perfection and creativity have been neglected in developing and underdeveloped societies. Although the issue of leisure time has highlighted and pave the way for showing the necessity of tourism development, unfortunately People do not pay attention more to leisure time since they have busy time in the present situation of Iran. It should be noted that Sasaki [33] has categorized free time in the life quality variables in his research on the creative city.

Finally, by considering the viewpoint of experts, it can be concluded that firstly, the visual characteristics and facilities in the city of Tabriz play a major role in the assessing capacity of creative tourism, and the creation and updating of these assets will play a significant role in attracting tourists and creative people, and, secondly; individuals must take steps to improve their personality, their abilities, talents and creativity. The conceptual model of research which involves the relationship between these factors and their contribution to the formation of creative tourism from the perspective of experts is shown in Figure 4.

Figure 4: Conceptual model of research.
Conclusion

In overall, the proportion of influential factors in tourism development including physical capital and visual assets, the personality upgrade, passive rules and scientific genius, informative environment, excellent coexistence, the introduction of new ideas, risk factor, leisure time is equivalent to 25.6%, 15%, 11.9%, 8.3%, 6.7%, 5.9%, 4.4%, and 3.7%, respectively based on the viewpoint of interviewees.

Based on the findings of the researchers, it can be clearly seen that Tabriz has potential for the growth and development of creative tourism. Today, with advancement of technology and the expansion of various social networks and the design of various websites around the world, it is necessary to introduce Tabriz using technology. It is imperative that managers of all fields involved in the tourism industry become acquainted with new types of tourism and accord their development according to their needs. With the pervasive advancement of technology and the rapid transfer of information in all over the world and a change in motivations and demands, modern tourists with high general information have sought for diversity. Therefore, there are suggestions for better creative tourism development in this city:

- Conduct seminars on creative tourism for managers to have a better understanding of the region.
- Construct a hotel with the style of the local tribes within the city in order to encourage tourists to experience life in those environments.
- Design and color some urban space by children for improving creativity.
- Research on one of the items of the UNESCO organization and the creation of infrastructure for converting Tabriz to a creative city based on fields proposed by UNESCO.
- Provide facilities and equipment for better interaction between the scientific community and managers for developing tourism.
- Hold public conferences and increase public awareness towards the benefits of tourism, especially creative tourism.
- Hold Azeri language classes for tourists to communicate well.
- Launch informative sites and websites to increase public information about the ethnicity and dialect of the region.
- Special support from carpet industry artists and provide an environment for teaching of carpet knowledge to indigenous people in the region.
- Improve the facilities of the urban space.
- Hold festivals for better interaction between local people and tourists and teaching respect for other cultures.

References

34. Maitland R (2007) Tourists, the creative class and distinctive areas in major cities. Tourism, creativity and development.
   The tourism and leisure experience: Consumer and managerial perspectives.