Environmental Factors for Germination of *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* Sclerotia

Michael E Foley1*, Münevver Doğramacı1, Mark West2 and William R Underwood1

1USDA-Agricultural Research Service, Sunflower and Plant Biology Research Unit, Fargo, ND 58102-2765, USA
2USDA-Agricultural Research Service, 2150 Centre Ave., Suite 300 Fort Collins, CO 80526, USA

**Abstract**

Basal stalk rot of sunflower is an economically important and rather unique disease among crops that are susceptible to *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum*. This disease is the result of myceliogenic germination of sclerotia whereby the vegetative hyphae infect the sunflower below the soil level. In contrast, sunflower head rot and similar diseases of susceptible crops result from carpogenic germination to produce airborne ascospores that infect above ground senescent or wounded tissues. Research was initiated on several factors reported to affect sclerotia germination as a prelude to genomic investigations of myceliogenic and carpogenic germination. Specifically, the effects of inoculum development temperature, sclerotia development temperature, conditioning temperature, conditioning of hydrated and desiccated sclerotia, and the duration of sclerotia desiccation on germination strain Sun87 sclerotia were reevaluated. As reported previously, we were not able to use conditioning temperature from -20°C to 30°C to differentiate myceliogenic and carpogenic germination for either hydrated or desiccated sclerotia. Besides conditioning temperature, inoculum production temperature, sclerotia formation period and temperature, and desiccation failed to distinguish the two forms of germination. The high level of variability for sclerotia germination between experiments indicates the critical nature of repeating all experiments aimed at understanding factors that influence sclerotia germination. Thus, other methods will be required to discover a reliable and non-confounded method that clearly differentiates myceliogenic and carpogenic germination of *S. sclerotiorum*.

**Keywords**: Ascospore; Carpogenic; Conditioning; Germination; Head rot; Myceliogenic; Sclerotinia; Stalk rot; Temperature

**Introduction**

*Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* is a necrotrophic fungal plant pathogen with a broad crop and non-crop host range that produces hard, asexual resting structures called sclerotia [1,2]. Sclerotia are a means by which a quiescent state in the soil can be maintained in the absence of suitable host or conditions favorable for germination and active growth [3]. Myceliogenic germination of sclerotia follow by root invasion of hyphae leads to basal stalk rot disease of sunflower, whereas carpogenic germination leads to head rot [2]. Some information exists on conditions for carpogenic germination; less information exists related to myceliogenic germination.

Huang [4] reported a method that changes the germination behavior from carpogenic to myceliogenic based on the temperature during conditioning of mature sclerotia of strain Sun87. Carpogenic germination occurred exclusively for sclerotia conditioned for 4 weeks at 0.5°C to 25°C; whereas, only myceliogenic germination occurred if conditioned at -20°C to -10°C. Additionally, Huang and Kozub [5] and Huang et al. [6] examined the effects of inoculum (mycelial mat) production temperature and desiccation of sclerotia after development, respectively on germination. Huang’s group reported that the favorable inoculum production temperature for carpogenic germination of Sun87 was 10°C for daughter sclerotia formed at 20°C, and that myceliogenic germination of Sun87 occurred most readily when the sclerotia were formed at 20°C to 25°C and were desiccated prior to germination.

We sought a reliable and non-confounded method to obtain exclusively myceliogenic or carpogenic germination to investigate the germination transcriptome regulating the two forms of sclerotial germination. Therefore, the objective of these experiments was to verify that the conditioning temperature treatments [4] would clearly distinguish carpogenic and myceliogenic germination.

**Materials and Methods**

Sclerotia for *Sclerotinia sclerotiorum* (Lib.) de Bary strains Sun87 (also known as 2148) originating from Canada [7] was provided by Dr. K.Y. Rashid, Agriculture and Agri-Food Canada. Strain 1980 originating from Nebraska [8] was provided by Dr. J. Rollins, University of Florida.

**Effect of sclerotia formation period and temperature and conditioning temperature on germination of Sun87**

Two experiments were conducted as described below.

**Experiment 1:** Sclerotia were formed by transferring plugs of mycelial mat to the center of 100 × 15 mm Petri dish containing full strength potato dextrose agar (PDA). These dishes were incubated in the dark at 10°C and 20°C for 4 and 8 weeks to facilitate growth of mycelia and formation of sclerotia (Figure 1). The sclerotia were then transferred to an open Petri dish in a laminar flow hood for a 1 day desiccation treatment or remained hydrated on the PDA. The desiccated and hydrated sclerotia were conditioned at -20°C, -10°C, 0.5°C, 10°C, or 30°C for 4 weeks as per Huang [4]. Thereafter, sclerotia were placed in glass 100 × 15 mm Petri dishes containing moist, sterile sand, sealed with parafilm, and carpogenic or myceliogenic germination (Figure 2) was determined after 4 weeks at 16°C in low continuous light. Each treatment had 6 biological replications with 20 sclerotia per replicate petri dish.

**Received** October 07, 2016; **Accepted** October 28, 2016; **Published** October 30, 2016


Copyright: © 2016 Foley ME, et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.
Statistical analysis

Data collected from the experiments revolved around counting the number of sclerotia germinating out of a set number of sclerotia exposed to a treatment condition. Therefore, experiments were evaluated by fitting generalized linear mixed models in order to test the factors of interest in the experiment. These models fit binomial proportions to treatments with a logit link. Proportions of sclerotia that germinated were compared among treatment conditions using Likelihood Ratio, Chi-Square or Z statistics.

Results

Effects of sclerotia formation period, development temperature, and conditioning temperature on germination of Sun87

We observed 88% and 98% carpogenic germination in the first experiment when sclerotia were developed for 4 and 8 weeks respectively at the 10°C formation temperature followed by conditioning them in a hydrated state at 10°C (Figure 4). Comparatively, carpogenic germination at 8 weeks was 85% and 51% for sclerotia conditioned at 0.5°C and 30°C, respectively. Conversely, carpogenic germination for sclerotia formed for 4 and 8 weeks at the 20°C formation temperature and conditioned in a hydrated state at 10°C was observed to be significantly (P<0.01) lower at 17% and 23% respectively when compared to sclerotia formed at the 10°C temperature. However, when sclerotia were desiccated prior to germination, carpogenic germination was limited to between 0% and 21% for either formation period (4 or 8 weeks) or for either development temperature (10°C or 20°C) and for all conditioning temperatures (Figure 4). Moreover, no more than 6% myceliogenic germination was observed among treatment means.
in experiment 1 regardless of the sclerятия formation period and temperature, and conditioning temperature (Supplemental Figure 1a).

Because germination levels in experiment 1 for Sun87 sclerotia formed at 20°C were decreased when compared to those formed at 10°C (Figure 4), we eliminated the 20°C sclerotia formation temperature and added two additional conditioning temperatures (5°C and 25°C) to be evaluated in experiment 2. The conditioning temperatures in experiment 2 that were most efficacious for carpogenic germination were similar to those in experiment 1, i.e., 0.5 and 10°C. In both experiments for all conditioning temperatures and sclerotia formed at 10°C, germination was generally greater for sclerotia formed for 8 weeks relative to 4 weeks (Figures 4 and 5). Overall carpogenic germination ranged from 1% to 98% in experiment 1 and from 5% to 99% in experiment 2 for sclerotia formed at 4 and 8 weeks at 10°C and conditioned in a hydrated state between -20°C to 30°C (Figures 4 and 5). When sclerotia were desiccated and conditioned at -20°C to 30°C, carpogenic germination was limited (0% to 40%) regardless of sclerotia formation period (Figure 5); these results are similar to those from experiment 1. For myceliogenic germination, treatments in experiment 2 resulted in 0% to 34% germination (Supplemental Figure 1b).

**Effect of inoculum production temperature, sclerotia formation temperature, and duration of sclerotia desiccation on germination of Sun87 and 1980**

Observations taken from experiments 1 and 2 did not lead to a high certainty of treatment conditions for obtaining strictly myceliogenic or carpogenic germination using the range of treatments, including conditioning temperatures as reported by Huang [4]. Therefore, we further utilized sclerotinia strains Sun87 and 1980 to examine two additional factors that could possibly separate carpogenic and myceliogenic germination, but were not explored in experiments 1 and 2 (Figure 3). These factors were: 1) the temperature for inoculum production (the material used to obtain mycelial mats for sclerotia formation), and 2) the duration of sclerotia desiccation. Strain 1980 was specifically chosen for experiments 3 and 4 to evaluate its germination since its genome has been sequenced, making it ideal for further genomics studies [9].

**Evaluation of Strain Sun87**

In experiment 3, the 8 weeks germination evaluation revealed that hydrated Sun87 sclerotia had 84% and 61% carpogenic germination in response to the 10°C and 25°C inoculum production temperatures, respectively, when the sclerotia formation temperature was 10°C (Figure 6a). Germination was 85% and 79% for the same conditions in experiment 4 (Figure 6b). When the sclerotia formation temperature was 20°C (Figure 6a) carpogenic germination at 8 weeks was observed to be 66% and 10% in response to the 10°C and 25°C inoculum production temperatures, respectively, in experiment 3. However, there was no carpogenic germination in experiment 4 with these treatments (Figure 6b).

Eight week germination rates for sclerotia strain Sun87 under the...
Evaluation of Strain 1980

Both experiments showed a statistically significant effect of sclerotia formation temperature on 8 week germination for hydrated sclerotia (P<0.001 for both experiments), but also statistically significant interaction between inoculum production temperature and sclerotia formation temperature on 8 weeks germination for hydrated sclerotia (P=0.0074 for experiment 3 and P=0.044 for experiment 4). In experiment 3, the 8 weeks germination evaluation revealed that hydrated 1980 sclerotia increased germination by 26% (N=4 reps, 66 sclerotia) to 35% (N=4 reps, 76 sclerotia) carpogenic germination in response to the 10°C and 25°C inoculum production temperatures, respectively, when sclerotia formation temperature was 10°C (Figure 7a). However, the 8 weeks evaluation revealed no significant difference (P=0.297) for carpogenic germination in response to the 10°C and 25°C inoculum production temperatures in both experiments. However, we observed ≤5% myceliogenic germination for Sun87 sclerotia following conditioning at -20°C.

Discussion

Our objective was to confirm previous reports outlining a reliable method to absolutely distinguish myceliogenic and carpogenic germination as a prelude to investigating the transcriptomes associated with the two forms of S. sclerotiorum germination. We procured strain Sun87 and repeated a study by Huang [4], which indicated different conditioning temperatures clearly distinguished carpogenic from myceliogenic germination. Our experiments were done in nearly the same manner as previously reported [4]. However, we conditioned sclerotia in our experiments in both the hydrated and desiccated states due to ambiguity in the methods, and a report by Huang et al. [6] indicating that desiccation of sclerotia was an important factor for myceliogenic germination. Huang [4] reported 100% myceliogenic germination for Sun87 sclerotia following conditioning at -20°C. However, we observed ≤5% myceliogenic germination of Sun87 sclerotia that were conditioned at -20°C in both the hydrated and desiccated study conditions showed consistency between experiments 3 and 4 although the levels of germination differed. Analysis of germination rates for both experiments showed a significant interaction between inoculum production and sclerotia formation temperatures with significance of P<0.01 for both. Evaluation of germination showed an increase from 37% carpogenic germination for the 10°C inoculum production temperature (N=4 reps, 64 sclerotia) to 63% carpogenic germination for the 25°C inoculum production temperature (N=1 rep, 16 sclerotia) when the sclerotia formation temperature was 10°C in experiment 3 (Figure 6a), although this was not found to be statistically significant compared to 25°C inoculum production temperature (P=0.0755, Z=-1.436). We qualify this result by noting that experiment 3 encountered contaminations for strain Sun87 in 3 of the 4 replicates when inoculum production occurred at 25°C, and do not consider this convincing evidence that increasing sclerotia formation temperature from 10°C to 20°C increases carpogenic germination. However, for the same treatment conditions in experiment 4 (Figure 6b), the increase from 10°C to 25°C inoculum production temperature resulted in an increase in germination from 16% to 33% (P<0.01, Z=-2.489) for 10°C sclerotia formation temperature. For sclerotia formed at 20°C in experiment 3 (Figure 6a), the 8 weeks germination evaluation revealed carpogenic germination for the 10°C and 25°C inoculum production temperatures, respectively. A similar decrease in germination was observed for carpogenic germination with 16% (N=4 reps, 80 sclerotia) for the 10°C inoculum production temperature and 0% (N=4 reps, 80 sclerotia) for the 25°C inoculum production temperatures in experiment 4 (Figure 6b). However, neither of these decreases were found to be statistically significant (P>0.25) for carpogenic germination after 8 weeks for desiccated 1980 sclerotia with any treatment combinations (Figures 7a and 7b).

Finally, for both Sun87 and 1980, there was no more than 5% myceliogenic germination (Supplemental Figures 2 and 3) for any combination of treatments. However, significant myceliogenic germination (P<0.0001), although very low, occurred only for the desiccated treatments. Additionally, no consistent differences in germination were observed between sclerotia desiccated beyond 1 day for either strain (data not presented).

Figure 7: Carpogenic germination of Sclerotinia sclerotiorum strain 1980 sclerotia in experiment 3A and experiment 4B. Inoculum production temperature for sclerotia was 10°C and 25°C, the sclerotia formation temperature was 10°C and 25°C, and germination was evaluated at 4 and 8 weeks. Prior to germination sclerotia were kept hydrated or desiccated for 1 day (see Figure 3).
We examined several other factors that might affect germination such as inoculum production temperature and duration of sclerotia desiccation. Huang and Kozub [5] examined inoculum production temperatures of 10°C, 25°C, and 30°C. They reported 84% carpogenic germination for Sun87 sclerotia whose inoculum was produced at 10°C and the sclerotia formed at 20°C; no more than 35% germination was observed for the 25°C and 30°C inoculum production temperatures for sclerotia formed at 20°C. In contrast, our results indicated that the 10°C and 25°C inoculum production temperatures for Sun87 resulted in 61% to 85% carpogenic germination, particularly when the sclerotia were formed at 10°C and they were kept hydrated (Figures 6a and 6b). Conversely, for strain Sun87 carpogenic germination was significantly lower (P<0.0001) if the sclerotia were produced at 20°C relative to 10°C when hydrated. However, for strain 1980 carpogenic germination was significantly higher (P<0.0001) if the sclerotia were produced at 20°C relative to 10°C (Figures 7a and 7b) when hydrated. It is known that carpogenic germination depends on the geographic origin of the strain and the temperature at which sclerotia are produced [7]. The different results from our two strains may be due to different geographic origins and thus temperature requirements. Ultimately, we were not able to verify that a low inoculum production temperature was the main factor affecting carpogenic germination of Sun87. Rather, a low temperature (10°C) during sclerotia formation seems to be the more important factor to enhance carpogenic germination of Sun87 and 1980.

Our first experiment indicated that drying sclerotia prior to conditioning had little effect on subsequent myceliogenic germination (Supplemental Figure 1). However, Huang et al. [6] reported that desiccation of strain S9 sclerotia at 25°C and near 0% relative humidity for 3 weeks significantly increased myceliogenic germination and hyphal growth at 25°C. We had data that air drying of Sun87 sclerotia for 1 day in a laminar flow hood facilitated complete desiccation (data not presented). Nevertheless, based on Huang et al. [6] we reasoned that prolonged desiccation may facilitate additional benefits for sclerotia germination similar to that which occurs when dormant seeds are subjected to afterripening under warm, dry conditions [10]. However, there was no benefit to a period of desiccation beyond 1 day for either strain 1980 or Sun87. In fact, desiccation still resulted in greater carpogenic than myceliogenic germination, even though the carpogenic germination levels were lower than if they were hydrated.

We did not identify a treatment that clearly distinguished myceliogenic from carpogenic germination for strain Sun87 based on inoculum production temperature, sclerotia formation period and temperature, conditioning temperatures, and desiccation. An important outcome of our experiments was the high level of variability for sclerotia germination indicating the critical nature of repeating experiments aimed at understanding factors that influence sclerotia germination, which may not have been done in past studies. In any event, other methods, such as injuring the sclerotia rind [11], manipulating the quantity and quality of light [12,13] and manipulating the type of germination using chemical treatments [14] are possible solutions to discovering a reliable and non-confounded method that clearly differentiate myceliogenic and carpogenic germination of S. sclerotiorum.

Acknowledgement

Ms. Cheryl Huckle and Ms. Michelle Gilley provided technical assistance.

References