

## Revisiting the Current Assays associated to Host Immune Responses against Tuberculosis Infection

Bianca Mothé<sup>1</sup> and Paulo RZ. Antas<sup>2\*</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Department of Biology, California State University San Marcos, San Marcos, CA, USA, 92096

<sup>2</sup>Laboratório de Imunologia Clínica, Instituto Oswaldo Cruz, FIOCRUZ, Rio de Janeiro, RJ, Brazil

\*Corresponding author: Paulo RZ. Antas, Laboratório de Imunologia Clínica, Instituto Oswaldo Cruz, Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, Tel: +55-21-3865-8152; E-mail: pzuquim@ioc.fiocruz.br

Received date: February 12, 2015, Accepted date: April 23, 2015, Published date: May 5, 2015

Copyright: ©2015 Mothé B, et al. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original author and source are credited.

### Mini Review

As an ancient microbe, *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* (MTB) is an extremely successful pathogen. MTB causes more deaths worldwide now than at any previous time in history as the World Health Organization (WHO) estimates that approximately one-third of the world's population (roughly 2 billion total) is infected with MTB [1]. MTB is a major health threat, causing 9 million new infections and between 2 and 3 million deaths annually. Future prospects look bleak due to the increasing impact of HIV and drug resistance MTB strains (MDR) on the TB epidemic [1].

The clinical course of TB provides clues as to the mechanisms that underlie MTB's success as a pathogen. First, MTB establishes infection with a small inoculum, suggesting that it inhibits innate immune responses. Second, it often persists throughout the life of the host, suggesting evasion of adaptive immunity. Third, the transmission of MTB from one host to another typically depends upon the formation of lung cavities in which aerosols are generated by coughing or sneezing. The mechanisms of lung cavitation are complex but include bystander damage of healthy tissue by the host cellular immune response. It is generally thought that granuloma formation is a means by which the host controls certain pathogens, most notably mycobacteria and fungal species [2]. Granulomas form in animal models of TB and in human infection the scarred result of the granulomatous response to initial infection is sometimes observed as a calcified lesion abutting the pleural in a lower lobe of the lung, the "Ghon lesion" [3]. Although the granuloma limits the extent of early infection, it is ultimately cell-mediated immunity involving T-cells that control MTB replication.

Protective host immune responses involve T-cells and macrophages (M $\phi$ ), whereas antibodies are unimportant by comparison [4]. MHC class I pathways and CD8<sup>+</sup> T-cells appear to be important in the host containment of virulent MTB [5-7]. Previous studies demonstrated that CD8<sup>+</sup> T-cell lines were capable of inhibiting MTB growth in vitro [8]. CD8<sup>+</sup> T-cells function as cytotoxic effector cells and it has been suggested that these cells play the greatest role in lysing infected cells in lesion that still contain few bacteria and therefore sterilize the granuloma [9,10]. It has been shown that in mice, moderate levels of protection can be obtained upon transferring CD8<sup>+</sup> T-cells even at late stages of infection [9,11]. In contrast, in most cases, the protection afforded by the CD4<sup>+</sup> T-cells is much greater than that seen by CD8<sup>+</sup> T-cells [12]. CD4<sup>+</sup> T-cells, mediated by MHC class II pathways, secrete IFN- $\gamma$  and activate M $\phi$  to produce reactive oxygen species (ROS) and nitric intermediates (RNI), thereby enhancing their microbicidal activity. In mice, depletion of CD4<sup>+</sup> T-cells prior to infection leads to increased bacterial burden and shortened survival [12-15]. These results are also shown in knockout models as both CD4<sup>-/-</sup> and MHC-

II<sup>-/-</sup> mice are extremely susceptible to MTB infection [16]. One of the difficulties in discerning the nature of the T-cell responses that correlate with protection has been that the rodent models used to study TB do not naturally "contain" infection in a manner analogous to how humans "contain" infection. Clinical observations and studies in humans provide insight into the components of true "containment."

The development of safe and effective vaccines for both drug-sensitive MTB and MDR remains a high priority for the scientific community. For decades, a number of factors have been considered responsible for the variable efficacy of *M. bovis* BCG vaccine, the only vaccine still available against TB. These factors are related to the strain, the dose, and protocol for administer the vaccine [17]. Ideally, a vaccine to prevent TB would confer lifelong protection. Despite significant efforts over the course of several decades, several important issues related to the immune responses or epitopes recognized by MTB remain to be addressed. An NIH-sponsored workshop of leading scientists and experts held in June 2007 reviewed data on T-cell and B-cell epitopes derived from MTB, and identified several important knowledge gaps:

- Epitopes have been described for only a small fraction of the MTB genome
- more systematic data is necessary, addressing the recognition of different antigens and epitopes in different stages of MTB infection and disease, and in different ethnicities
- definition of epitopes recognized in small animals and non-human primates would also be beneficial to further evaluations of new vaccine candidates and vaccination strategies.

CD4<sup>+</sup> T-cell populations appear to be very important as HIV-infected persons with latent TB infection are at high risk of progressing to active TB, and frequently present with extrapulmonary or disseminated infection [18,19]. Furthermore, treatment of HIV-TB co-infected persons with antiretroviral therapy often causes increased clinical and radiographic evidence of TB in the lungs as the CD4<sup>+</sup> count recovers – the so-called "paradoxical reaction", or "immune-reconstitution inflammatory syndrome-IRIS" [18,20]. In summary, both HIV and TB are life-threatening pathogens in their own right, but their synergic effects on the immune system during co-infection markedly enhance their effect on the host [20-22].

In terms of assays to detect cellular immune responses in the context of TB, there are few that are clinically available. One of the main issues that exist is what specific antigens from MTB are eliciting immune responses. The tuberculin skin test (TST) does not measure antigen-specific CD4<sup>+</sup> or CD8<sup>+</sup> T-cells and often gives false results [23]. The IFN-gamma release assays-IGRA, such as Quantiferon-Gold (QFT) and T-SPOT.TB, however, are more appropriate in detecting

TB-specific responses [24]. The three antigens composing the QFT test, ESAT-6, CFP-10, and TB7.7, are represented as peptides and detected using whole blood [25]. Nevertheless, there are now more specific assays to detect immune responses after infection with MTB.

In all of these assays, a clear understanding of which antigens from MTB elicit immune responses is direly needed. Recent studies have focused on the identification of new antigens [26-31]. These studies have varied from *in silico* approaches, [31] to gene expression approaches [29] as well as MHC-specific methods [26,27,30]. The identification of TB-specific antigens that elicit immune responses provides the framework for new assays to assess cellular immunogenicity.

New assays to detect CD4<sup>+</sup> and CD8<sup>+</sup> T-cell responses after MTB infection includes cell specific detection systems, such as flow cytometry and enzyme based assays (such as ELISPOT) [24,32-37]. These assays will quantitatively and qualitatively measure specific CD4<sup>+</sup> and/or CD8<sup>+</sup> T-cell responses that are specific for MTB. However, albeit TB is the leading cause of death in AIDS patients worldwide, very little is known about early TB infection or MTB/HIV co-infection in infants. Thus, clinically relevant newborn animal model to study TB infection is urgently needed. An aerosol model in neonatal nonhuman primates which mimics clinical and bacteriological characteristics of MTB infection, with the potential to allow the establishment of a TB co-infection model of pediatric AIDS, as seen in human newborns/infants has been established [38]. There, post infection specific cell-mediated immune responses and lesions were detected suggestive of the classic Ghon focus in human children, as it represents the first example of early MTB infection of newborn macaques. Using ELISPOT assays, the IL-12 production correlated with early MTB infection lesions seen by routine thoracic radiographs. That study indicates a unique opportunity to further characterize immunopathogenesis and establish a MTB/SIV co-infection model for pediatric AIDS.

In sum, MTB is an extremely well adapted pathogen which has co-existed with the human host for millennia, and it has learned how to modulate potentially protective host immune responses to insure its own survival. Although there is still no correlate for protection in TB, there might be a harmonization of laboratory assays which ideally can be used to evaluate the immunogenicity, safety and parameters, such as vaccine "take" of a TB vaccine candidate. Better understanding of the human immune response to MTB infection and disease, plus the recent progress in immunology, microbiology, and molecular genetics, will provide fundamental shifts that promise to have extraordinary impact on the approaches to TB control. Ultimately, it is hoped that progress in the field of vaccinology will lead to a more rational approach towards the improvement of the BCG vaccine.

## References

1. Murray CJ, Salomon JA (1998) Modeling the impact of global tuberculosis control strategies. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 95: 13881-13886.
2. Saunders BM, Cooper AM (2000) Restraining mycobacteria: role of granulomas in mycobacterial infections. *Immunol Cell Biol* 78: 334-341.
3. Turner OC, Basaraba RJ, Frank AA, Orme IM (2003) In *Granulomatous Infections and Inflammations: Cellular and Molecular Mechanisms*, D. L. Boros, Ed, ASM Press, Washington, DC.
4. Flynn JL, Chan J (2001) Immunology of tuberculosis. *Annu Rev Immunol* 19: 93-129.
5. Flynn JL, Goldstein MM, Triebold KJ, Koller B, Bloom BR (1992) Major histocompatibility complex class I-restricted T cells are required for resistance to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* infection. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 89: 12013-12017.
6. Rolph MS, Raupach B, Köbernick HH, Collins HL, Pérarnau B, et al. (2001) MHC class Ia-restricted T cells partially account for beta2-microglobulin-dependent resistance to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Eur J Immunol* 31: 1944-1949.
7. Sousa AO, Mazzaccaro RJ, Russell RG, Lee FK, Turner OC, et al. (2000) Relative contributions of distinct MHC class I-dependent cell populations in protection to tuberculosis infection in mice. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 97: 4204-4208.
8. De Libero G, Flesch I, Kaufmann SH (1988) Mycobacteria-reactive Lyt-2+ T cell lines. *Eur J Immunol* 18: 59-66.
9. Andersen P (1997) Host responses and antigens involved in protective immunity to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Scand J Immunol* 45: 115-131.
10. Kaufmann SH (1988) CD8+ T lymphocytes in intracellular microbial infections. *Immunol Today* 9: 168-174.
11. Orme IM (1987) The kinetics of emergence and loss of mediator T lymphocytes acquired in response to infection with *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *J Immunol* 138: 293-298.
12. Grotzke JEL, Lewinsohn DM (2005) Role of CD8+ T lymphocytes in control of *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* infection. *Microbes Infect* 7: 776-788.
13. Muller I, Cobbold SP, Waldmann H, Kaufmann SH, (1987) Impaired resistance to *Mycobacterium tuberculosis* infection after selective *in vivo* depletion of L3T4+ and Lyt-2+ T cells. *Infect Immun* 55: 2037-2041.
14. Leveton C, Barnass S, Champion B, Lucas S, De Souza B, et al. (1989) T-cell-mediated protection of mice against virulent *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*. *Infect Immun* 57: 390-395.
15. Flory CM, Hubbard RD, Collins FM (1992) Effects of *in vivo* T lymphocyte subset depletion on mycobacterial infections in mice. *J Leukoc Biol* 51: 225-229.
16. Caruso AM, Serbina N, Klein E, Triebold K, Bloom BR, et al. (1999) Mice deficient in CD4 T cells have only transiently diminished levels of IFN-gamma, yet succumb to tuberculosis. *J Immunol* 162: 5407-5416.
17. Antas PR, Castello-Branco LR (2008) New vaccines against tuberculosis: lessons learned from BCG immunisation in Brazil. *Trans R Soc Trop Med Hyg* 102: 628-630.
18. Breen RA, Smith CJ, Bettinson H, Dart S, Bannister B, et al. (2004) Paradoxical reactions during tuberculosis treatment in patients with and without HIV co-infection. *Thorax* 59: 704-707.
19. Lee MP, Chan JW, Ng KK, Li PC (2000) Clinical manifestations of tuberculosis in HIV-infected patients. *Respirology* 5: 423-426.
20. Fishman JE, Saraf-Lavi E, Narita M, Hollender ES, Ramsinghani R, et al. (2000) Pulmonary tuberculosis in AIDS patients: transient chest radiographic worsening after initiation of antiretroviral therapy. *AJR Am J Roentgenol* 174: 43-49.
21. de Noronha AL, Fica AB, Nogueira L, Barral A, Barral-Netto M, (2008) Lung granulomas from *Mycobacterium tuberculosis*/HIV-1 co-infected patients display decreased *in situ* TNF production. *Pathol Res Pract* 204: 155-161.
22. Siawaya D, Ruhwald M, Eugen-Olsen J, Walzl G, (2007) Correlates for disease progression and prognosis during concurrent HIV/TB infection. *Int J Infect Dis* 11: 289-299.
23. Kunst H (2006) Diagnosis of latent tuberculosis infection: the potential role of new technologies. *Respir Med* 100: 2098-2106.
24. Won DI, Park JR (2010) Flow cytometric measurements of TB-specific T cells comparing with QuantiFERON-TB gold. *Cytometry B Clin Cytom* 78: 71-80.
25. Whitworth WC, Goodwin DJ, Racster L, West KB, Chuke SO, et al. (2014) Variability of the QuantiFERON®-TB gold in-tube test using automated and manual methods. *PLoS One* 9: e86721.
26. Arlehamn CS, Sidney J, Henderson R, Greenbaum JA, James EA, et al. (2012) Dissecting mechanisms of immunodominance to the common tuberculosis antigens ESAT-6, CFP10, Rv2031c (hspX), Rv2654c (TB7.7), and Rv1038c (EsxJ). *J Immunol* 188: 5020-5031.

27. Axelsson-Robertson R, Loxton AG, Walzl G, Ehlers MM, et al. (2013) A broad profile of co-dominant epitopes shapes the peripheral Mycobacterium tuberculosis specific CD8+ T-cell immune response in South African patients with active tuberculosis. *PLoS One* 8: e58309.
28. Clark SA, Martin SL, Pozniak A, Steel A, Ward B, et al. (2007) Tuberculosis antigen-specific immune responses can be detected using enzyme-linked immunospot technology in human immunodeficiency virus (HIV)-1 patients with advanced disease. *Clin Exp Immunol* 150: 238-244.
29. Commandeur S, van Meijgaarden KE, Prins C, Pichugin AV, Dijkman K, et al. (2013) An unbiased genome-wide Mycobacterium tuberculosis gene expression approach to discover antigens targeted by human T cells expressed during pulmonary infection. *J Immunol* 190: 1659-1671.
30. Kassa D, Ran L, Geberemeskel W, Tebeje M, Alemu A, et al. (2012) Analysis of immune responses against a wide range of Mycobacterium tuberculosis antigens in patients with active pulmonary tuberculosis. *Clin Vaccine Immunol* 19: 1907-1915.
31. Khan MK, Zaman S, Chakraborty S, Chakravorty R, Alam MM, et al. (2014) In silico predicted mycobacterial epitope elicits in vitro T-cell responses. *Mol Immunol* 61: 16-22.
32. Kim CH, Choi KJ, Yoo SS, Lee SY, Won DI, et al. (2014) Comparative analysis of whole-blood interferon-gamma and flow cytometry assays for detecting post-treatment Immune responses in patients with active tuberculosis. *Cytometry B Clin cytom* 86: 236-243.
33. Lee J, Lee SY, Won DI, Cha SI, Park JY, et al. (2013) Comparison of whole-blood interferon- $\gamma$  assay and flow cytometry for the detection of tuberculosis infection. *J Infect* 66: 338-345.
34. Leung WL, Leung Lai K, Shan Leung VS, Wai Yip C, Chiu Leung C, et al. (2009) Comparison of intracellular cytokine flow cytometry and an enzyme immunoassay for evaluation of cellular immune response to active tuberculosis. *Clin vaccine immunol* 16: 344-351.
35. Prezzemolo T, Guggino G, La Manna MP, Di Liberto D, Dieli F, et al. (2014) Functional Signatures of Human CD4 and CD8 T Cell Responses to Mycobacterium tuberculosis. *Front Immunol* 5: 180.
36. Sauzullo I, Scrivo R, Mengoni F, Ermocida A, Coppola M, et al. (2014) Multi-functional flow cytometry analysis of CD4+ T cells as an immune biomarker for latent tuberculosis status in patients treated with tumour necrosis factor (TNF) antagonists. *Clin Exp Immunol* 176: 410-417.
37. Syed Ahamed Kabeer B, Sikhamani R, Swaminathan S, Perumal V, Paramasivam P, et al. (2009) Role of interferon gamma release assay in active TB diagnosis among HIV infected individuals. *PLoS One* 4: e5718.
38. Cepeda M, Salas M, Folwarczny J, Leandro AC, Hodara VL, et al. (2013) Establishment of a neonatal rhesus macaque model to study Mycobacterium tuberculosis infection. *Tuberculosis (Edinb)* 93, Suppl:S51-9.